

Report on Skills Workshop 4-5 June 2007

India Habitat Centre, Lodhi Road, New Delhi.

Participants: Adeel Faheem, Feyza Bhatti (Pakistan)
David Korboe (Ghana)
All members of the CORD-RECOUP India qualitative research team and core members
Professor Kenneth King (Edinburgh University)

Monday: 4 June 2007

The objective of this workshop:

A two days skills workshop was the first concrete step towards the next sub theme of the project- Skills Development and its outcome for the poor. The participation of Ghana, Pakistan and India in the workshop enabled us to gain insights into the diverse scenario of skill development in the three countries, enriching our knowledge of the field and providing us scope of comparability with the rest of the partner countries.

The workshop started with a welcome by Claire. She thanked Kenneth for giving her the idea for a skills workshop and mentioned how the Cambridge workshop for a similar purpose had been a good experience. This gave an opportunity to have a common understanding of themes and perspectives. The objective of this workshop was to present the respective research designs conceptualized in the context of each country's skill development and livelihood issues. Further, the aim was to share, brainstorm and come to a schedule which would be most workable in the respective countries. She said that unlike Ghana, Pakistan and India were not so used to qualitative research and have been introduced to it by RPC.

All 3 countries were at different stages:

Pakistan: In Pakistan the quantitative survey was over and they were looking for qualitative sites. It was exciting that inputs from their quantitative survey would have implications for their qualitative survey.

India: Sites for the qualitative survey had been selected and the household census had been done. Also one theme had been done.

Ghana: Institutional survey for the skills theme had been done. Here they would not be using a household survey in the qualitative research sites as a base for the main skills research.

The quantitative survey in India would have implications for the qualitative work. But this will take place much later than the qualitative work in India. There is little data

available on training systems in India, whether formal or informal. Even the NSSO data is unreliable and hesitates to give state-wise break ups.

Session 1

The policy context of skills development initiatives: An overview with special reference to Ghana, Pakistan and India:

Kenneth King

Briefing on the policy environment on Skills, Kenneth King compared India, Ghana and Pakistan. The policy for skills development has never been more promising than now in the 3 countries. Musharraf has promised one million skilled people by 2010. However, Skill Development Programmes (SDPs) in Pakistan are not necessarily pro-poor. He talked of the differences in skills investment in different countries, and also compared China with India. They are both hailed as success stories, but there is a huge difference in level of investments. In China 50% were in vocational schools but **in India only 3%** were in vocational schools. Indonesia's example was also given where among their workers 30% had vocational skills and 70% were academically oriented. The government is planning to reverse the proportions. The investment level in Pakistan was very low, though the government wants to increase it to 1 million skilled workers by 2010. India is in mission mode with funds flowing in for upgrading skills development facilities. Ghana has high visibility plans for youth and employment. However all these plans are not for removing poverty but for upgrading skills and improving exports.

In the skills design process he said the key issue was how and under what conditions do Skill Development Programmes help in poverty alleviation and breaking the cycle of poverty. Skill is not a magic wand which will automatically alleviate poverty. So we need to look at enabling and disabling environment in skill development and their effect on labour market outcomes. (This was to be later discussed in detail on day 2 of the workshop.) DFID plan is to look at it through a lens of poverty. Kenneth added that the studies undertaken by DFID related to skills and although studies have been done on three aspects namely, access, quality and outcomes they are edu-centric rather than poverty centric issues. Unless you attend to the quality of Vocational Training Institutes (VTIs) you can't look at outcomes. It's all about jobs, work and self employment.

Talking of skill outcomes and occupations, Kenneth suggested the following:

- Explore the different stages people go through after school. For instance, initial learners (learning on the job). Through this we can try and gauge the pathways people take to reach a particular income generating activity
- What is the meaning of skills in training?
- Involvement of formal sector in providing opportunities in gainful employment.

It is important for outcomes to review different pathways:

1. One unit of analysis could be young learners (the ustaad – trainee relationship used initially for preliminary work – a kind of unpaid labour.)
2. Second is where people have nearly completed their training.
3. Third is where people are masters and are working in their respective fields.
4. Fourth set is of people who are more established.

Points to ponder:

- One needs to look at clustering cohesion and connections.
- How do we deal with an enabling factor?
- Is there some value in selecting a degree of cohesion and consistency to the questions you ask from the VTIs ? Kenneth gave the example of mehndi which could only be an indigenous industry.
- Is it worth going to one of the big textile firms, which is highly exploitative? It could bring out the animosity which owners have towards skill development.

Session 2

The Context: Ghana, Pakistan and India --- The education, training and employment scenario in these countries

Ghana: David Korboe

David discussed the education, training and skills scenario in Ghana. In Ghana there is a strong North-South divide in terms of endowment and this is even more strongly felt in the education field.

The survey was done in the institutes of Northern Ghana – public, private for profit and private not for profit (NGO). The cycle of basic education is for 9 years but it is difficult for the people to make a transition from junior to senior secondary school due to poverty, very low level of instruction (6 classes and 2 teachers) or as they didn't do too well at studies. So they opted for vocational training.

Aspirations people have from training are mainly: getting certificates, accessing formal training and getting work. Interestingly, David pointed that if people are not able to pay the entire fees, they are not stopped from completing the training (if they have paid the initial fees) but they are not issued the certificates. This meant they could not get employment in the formal sector. However, as they had acquired the requisite skills they could gain employment in the informal sector or could be self employed. For them, certificates may not have much value as a pile of these keep lying in the institutes and they do not or cannot afford to collect them. Surprisingly, the drop out rate from training in free centres was about 60% due to the following reasons:

1. When they see they won't achieve their aspirations they back out.
2. Opportunity cost for the very poor is very high.
3. Quality of trainer- trainee relationship is very poor.

In terms of post training environment, start up capital is a problem and economy creates another barrier. The link between the training provisions and jobs in local industry is very

weak and therefore training does not ensure a job. However, there were some success stories. Electricians would set up a materials' shop and offer discounted labour with it. We need to look at access and quality but emphasis should be on outcome. Elaborating on the role of NGOs, he stated that NGOs proved to be more effective in providing jobs to the poor as there is technical support and fall back mechanisms. NGOs also provided counseling and monitored and assisted graduates and trainees.

Capitation grants have been put in place wherein government subsidises education. There has been a 20% increase in current enrollment after this. However, being in school doesn't equate to being educated. Though most people can write their first names they can't write their second names. Now there are beginning to be more girls in school than boys in the initial classes but the drop-out rate for girls later is much faster. The formal economy is stagnating.

As far as quality of training is concerned it can be said that there is an over supply at some levels but at other levels there is good quality.

Pakistan: Adeel Faheem

As Pakistan is a South Asian country, the context of skill training in Pakistan was similar to that of India. One requires 12 years of education to enrol in a technical/vocational institute.

Education:

- Gross enrolment ratio in Pakistan is far lower than in other South Asian countries.
- Half of Pakistan's adult population has no education.
- The male-female divide is more than 100%.
- 8.15 million children are never enrolled.
- 70% children reach class 5.

As a result employment is low.

Employment:

- 43% are engaged in agriculture and this number is stagnant since the past 10 years.
- Informal sector - 70% employment in non-agriculture.
- 48.5% of these employed are illiterates.
- Low skilled workers predominate.
- Nature of job is contractual for low skilled workers.

Trends in Training:

Quoting an unpublished World Bank (2006) study by Jan & Yavchenko, Adeel added:

- 15% people in the age group 15-64 years who had an education of intermediate (12 years) and above and 8% with matriculation and less had received training.
- Popular trainings for males: computer, driving and electrician.

- Popular trainings for females: knitting, embroidery and dress making.
- Training was mostly through informal channels though it has been found that with economic growth, the percentage of people enrolling in training institutes is increasing.

Returns to Education:

- There is no guarantee of getting employment after technical/vocational education but once employed the returns are greater than for someone who is not trained.
- Returns to education are lower than in other countries and returns to investment are even lower.
- Probability of getting training is higher with education and also depends on geographical location.
- Returns from general education are 5-7 % while those from training are 10-12%. Also probability of unemployment does not change with training and therefore there is no incentive for training.

India: Claire Noronha

Claire started her session with the comment that India is a vibrant democracy and at the moment it is a booming economy but it is and has been a society of privilege and inequality. For the large numbers of those at the bottom of the scale the situation remains bleak. She focused on education, training and the impact of these for their development. There has been a marked improvement in literacy rates from 1951 to 2001. In 1951 we had only 25% males literate, 10% females. By 2001 the figures were 75 % males literate, 50% female. Today over 90% of children between 6 - 14 years are in school.

Education:

Schooling for the average Indian would depend on 2 sets of factors: individual and location/region. Individual factors include gender, caste and class. Location would include region and whether area was rural or urban. India is no 'knowledge economy' in terms of educational levels of the general population. As of 1999 (NSSO) less than 50% of the most educationally advantaged group – urban males- make it above secondary level and among the least advantaged group – rural women - 65% were illiterate. Focusing on poor communities it was felt that there was great enthusiasm for schooling. However class, caste and gender deprivation often coexist. Low education levels were observed (generally 6-8 years of schooling although many boys make it beyond secondary level). Also quality of schooling was low– studies suggest that primary school does not give literacy. Some 8 years of schooling give reading fluency. There was heterogeneity even within this. The relatively better off were able to access better schooling opportunities.

Employment:

She said we needed to introspect on what faces the millions of school leavers in poor communities. What are the pressures on them to earn? Can they be part of a family

enterprise? Must they look for wage labour? Parents would like their children to be employed in the formal sector because of secure incomes, health security, housing and other loans, provident fund, pensions (even if at low end of scale). But only 7 % of employment is provided by this sector. So what actually happens is that the children will be absorbed in the 'informal' sector.

Some features of the informal sector are:

- Unregulated but productive activity.
- "Fuzzy" in what it includes.
- Activities can be classified in:
 - Services (traditional and contemporary)
 - Production (traditional and contemporary)
 - Trade (traditional and contemporary)

However the compartments are not watertight.

Training:

The training systems that these children can access are:

- The formal system – training is provided in institutions with certificates – private and government.
- The hereditary system (also informal) – depends on aptitude, connections, and demand for the craft. This is most important in traditional services (snake-charmers) or in traditional production (goldsmiths)
- The modern sector 'informal system' – learning on the job is most visible in contemporary services (electricians, mechanics), contemporary production (in micro-enterprises)

The Formal training system, i.e., vocational education is provided in classes 11 and 12 in a limited number of schools, and has a highly inadequate provision. Only some 3% of those enrolled in class 11 and 12 level are taking these courses. ITIs, ITCs and polytechnics have low educational levels entry – class 8 is one entry point. But most trades demand class 10 and class 12. ITIs are mainly focused on engineering trades. According to DGET data, January 2005, the number of ITIs and ITCs is extremely inadequate. There are only 1.85 ITIs and 3.27 ITCs per million population. The total capacity of ITIs and ITCs in the four southern states is higher than the capacity in the northern states. However, the quality of these institutions has been criticised. Interestingly, according to the study ITIs are more successful than ITCs perhaps because ITIs have a screening mechanism and accept better students. They may also be more stringent in grading students during intermediate examinations so that poorly performing ones drop out early. The trades they offer may be more in demand in the labour market than the trades offered by ITCs.

Little research is available on the informal sector. Some cluster specific studies are available. Hence our focus on education and training outcomes in poor communities is valuable.

There is an unfavourable economic environment for those with low education because of rapid technological change. Large numbers have been pushed out of lower skilled jobs in factories. The Information Communication Technology (ICT) revolution is bringing ever more change. At the same time Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP) has caused distinct downsizing of public sector undertakings and of government offices. Casualisation of the workforce has increased. In 1983 it was 28.2 for the rural male and became 40.6 by 1999. In other words for every one man with a regular job, more than 4 were casual.

Breman stresses fragmentation of the labour market – labour opportunities even within the informal sector are often restricted to a subgroup of workers.

Session 3:

Inputs from RECOUP quantitative survey in Pakistan with special reference to skills

In this session the Pakistan Team presented their preliminary findings from a part of the RECOUP Pakistan quantitative survey (711 households, 3000 individuals) that they have already completed in Pakistan. These findings were based on the RECOUP quantitative household survey. The two provinces in Pakistan in which they conducted their fieldwork are Punjab and NWFP (6 districts in Punjab and 3 districts in NWFP). The household questionnaire that they used had one section which dealt with skills in detail. It included questions on technical and vocational education (the nature and cost, amount of fees paid, sources of funding). The questions were framed to capture whether the person had ‘ever’ taken any training and information related to that or whether the person concerned is ‘currently’ taking any training and information related to it. (From the data gathered it was found that people were mostly taking training in dress making and tailoring followed by embroidery, crafts making, teaching, nursing, professional skills (hotel management, catering and tourism, etc.)

Costs and sources of funding: Two-thirds of those who took training paid nothing and 16% paid Rs1100-10,000. Relatives and family are the major sources of funding. As far as industrial concentration and employment structure are concerned their preliminary finding is that 50% workers are wage employees.

Findings from the SMEs data set: They also gave data from a SMEs (Small and Medium Enterprises) survey. The sample consisted of 651 Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) from 10 industrial cities, the main sectors being services and manufacturing. The number of employees varied from 7-20. 84% of the SME employees had 1-10 years of experience; 50% employees said that they don’t give any training to employers.

Employee findings suggest 62% were skilled and 32% unskilled. 90% of the employees had an educational qualification of less than matriculation. (**Proportion who took training?**)

Some lessons from the Survey: Informal channels impart most skills; the most popular skills being dress making, embroidery, mechanics and teaching. The skilled workers were mainly into the service sector, while the unskilled ones worked as wage employees.

Research Questions:

- The key question was: **How skills may or may not empower people to come out of poverty?** They recognize the 5 pillars of skill development viz. individual, family, institutions, employer, and environment in their research design.
- An assessment of all factors is needed to understand the pathways of access to skills.
- At the individual/ household level, an attempt was made at understanding the culture of skill acquisition and how the decision about the type of skill to be learned is made.
- Risk diversification of the family was an important question.
- Importance of average v/s marginal returns from skills.
- There was need to focus on the intergenerational transfer of skills within the family settings.
- At the institutional level, there was a need to conduct interviews with the trainers as well as the employer-cum-trainer.

Their sample consists of one rural and one urban area from the two districts in the two provinces. One of the selected areas, Sargodha in Punjab, is dominated by industry. The other, Charsadah in NWFP, is dominated by agriculture.

The methodology and framework of qualitative and quantitative survey has to be different.

Feyza added some insights. According to her, culture and caste play an important role. The family is the decision maker. Sometimes the family invests in one child (in terms of education, training and employment) and this child later becomes the protector and saviour.

Session 4:

Proposed Research Design -- Ghana -- David Korboe

According to David the **key** question that he identified for the skills strand in Ghana was ***“How can skills be made to work for the poor?”*** He stressed that though **access** and **quality** are as important as **‘outcomes’** yet the focus will not be equally divided between these three factors. Rather, outcomes being the key factor of the research project will enjoy more focus than the other two. However he also made it clear that this does not mean that the other two would not be given any importance. He added that it is just a matter of prioritizing the key elements i.e. centering the research on very clear focal points.

It was necessary to distinguish the primary determinants of training outcomes from “other influential” factors. The two main issues that he identified for the research design were:

- a) **What do the poor gain from training?**
- b) What else- apart from training – do we need to focus on to answer the key question? ---that brings us to the key element of the **enterprise environment**.

He then went on to the introduction of the exploratory work that has already been done in northern Ghana. It was done to capture information about the training provision at the **institutional** level in Ghana. The findings told us that most people in Ghana acquire training through traditional methods. The unit of research in Ghana’s case is the **Enterprise**. And even for the second phase of analysis it will be the **enterprise, micro and small enterprise (MSE)**, and the respondents will be picked up from the enterprise itself as it aims to study the **Traditional Apprenticeship** sector in Ghana. The pool of information about the enterprise environment will be strengthened in the second stage of the research.

Next David talked about sampling, which will be purposive and will include location sampling, enterprise sampling and informant sampling. For Location Sampling the plan is to take into account spatial differences – north-south divide (reflecting differences in human, physical and natural capital) and the rural- urban divide. Here, David clarified, that the usage of the term ‘rural’ is not mechanical but they have created a meaning for it themselves and thus before classifying a place as rural, they have delved deep into the character of the place and then given their own meanings.

For the enterprise sampling, what came forward in the Ghana design was their decision to pick up a few selected skills i.e. mechanics & tailors and then conduct intensive interviews with the respondents. The Ghana design included the selection of the skills to be studied in such a way that there will be equal samples from male and female enterprises. The two enterprises chosen were mechanics and dressmaking, the latter being a female dominated enterprise.

The informant sampling would be at three levels –

- 1) The young MSE owners (for current histories as entrepreneurs/trainers).
- 2) More established MSE owners (both successful and unsuccessful so that both kinds of change can be analyzed). The main basis for selection is that all must have started poor. For additional perspectives, more groups will be included like current trainees, and journey persons.
- 3) Other secondary informants will be from trade associations, district planners, etc. Some informants will be carried forward from Stage 1 like specific VTI heads and other reliable informants.

The content of the interviews will vary according to the respondent. Thus for the masters the main points will be education and training histories, employment histories comprising start-up, after start-up, etc. The enterprise environment will include markets, technology, registration, etc. History of other livelihood activities and assessment of change and

outcome will also be included. For trainees, the emphasis will be on education, training access, training quality and expectations. For capturing more about the enterprise environment, the focus will be on legislative framework, certification framework, socio-cultural framework, trade associations and other such bodies.

The time frame that has been decided is 6 weeks for north and 6 for south. The institutional issues will be addressed in a separate round (2009).

At this point Adeel asked if outcomes will eventually take us back to the **access** issue. He also asked how SME s in Pakistan were different from the MSE s in Ghana. David replied that in Ghana the MSEs are very small units with very small employment. They are largely informal sector enterprises; in fact they are traditional enterprises.

Session 5:

Proposed research design – India – Claire Noronha

The main differences in the approach adopted in the research design of Ghana and that of India, according to Claire, were:

1. The unit of analysis- for Indian design it is the household and for Ghana it is the enterprise.
2. The Indian design will focus on the community and the skills found in the community as a whole while the Ghana design will focus on a few selected skills.

India's sample states for this survey are Alwar (in Rajasthan) and Dewas (in Madhya Pradesh). An urban and a rural site in each of these districts have been selected and the reasons for choosing them were - ITI facility, proximity to industrial belt, access for researchers. So it was assumed that skills provision was reasonable and utilisation would have a favourable climate. The sharing of the preliminary work included the information about the household census to create an education and occupational profile of the 4 communities. Information was also sought about their training but this was not easily obtained. Collection of secondary data on schemes available has begun. Some preliminary insights that were gathered from the census information were that in both the districts, there was a decline in industries but Alwar was less affected than Dewas, possibly because of proximity to Delhi. An important finding regarding skill development was that those with better education levels and upper castes accessed both training and employment more easily.

The Indian design is looking at 4 broad questions:

1. What are the main skill development opportunities available to the poor?
2. How do the poor evaluate these opportunities?
3. What barriers stand in the way of their accessing these opportunities?
4. How have these opportunities helped them, especially in getting gainful employment and secure incomes?

Main methods will include semi-structured interviews with different people like young men (in the age group 20-34 years), their fathers, staff of ITIs and successful

entrepreneurs in the community, group discussions with young people and interviews with policy makers and local informants about the enabling environment. The criteria for sample selection of youth will be education (class 8th pass & above), current occupation, and training taken. Issues will be looked at across castes which will give diversity of pathways and different perceptions.

The interviews will focus on education received, process of drop-out, and benefits of school education, aspirations and preferences v/s actual pathways taken and barriers faced. Role of education in the process of getting training and employment will also be looked into.

She noted that there were advantages in working from the communities (as opposed to the Ghana design.) This

- Enables a more contextualized and deepening understanding. Can look at each theme for the qualitative research in turn.
- Negligible grassroots qualitative research on outcomes of education for adult population.
- In India decisions and strategies for training etc are often taken by elders – both fathers and youth to be interviewed.

Formal trainers will also be a part of the sample i.e. there will be an attempt to capture the institutional perspective as well.

She felt that the Ghana investigation could be somewhat similar to the Indian one if we took those who had been trained at driving and tailoring in the sample communities.

How ever neither driving nor tailoring is an ITI course though we may find polytechnics for the latter. Driving will provide both institutional and on the job training pathways and crosses caste. It could be expanded to include mechanics. Tailoring too should offer a rich study as it is a skill in transition. Sewing machines are a valued commodity in homes and also seen in workplaces. In India too tailors are under threat from a booming readymade garment sector.

Another difference was the emphasis on gender. In the Ghana design it is built into the sample but in the Indian design as there are very few cases of skill development amongst women so there can only be case studies. The number depends on the availability of the cases and also time.

A major anxiety about being ‘selective’ about skills was the possibility of losing richness of data. There was potential for other studies. Perhaps computer related jobs should be studied as there were a fair number of these in 3 sites. However, those who had taken this pathway were generally quite well off.

We could look into the implications of ‘contractors’ for labour -- for the casual labour route.

The role of education on traditional crafts where available could be studied.

Also ITI success stories – migrants

It was possibly necessary to increase sample numbers in some sites and reduce them in others.

The gender perspective could emerge by:

- Tabulating the employment and education profile of men and women in the community.
- From household schedules. Fathers would be asked about both sons **and** daughters.
- Case studies were possible as mentioned earlier as there are a few women in different kinds of occupations. Mostly at home, only working if in dire economic need. **Time constraint**

A tentative sampling figure was given: 40-60 HH interviews, 3 institutions per district, 3 workplaces per district (success stories preferably), 2-3 key informants.

Session 6

Discussion: -- Challenges for the research design

The concluding session of the day ended with a discussion on ways to capture how training systems operate – through community or cluster. An enabling environment is the most difficult thing to look at. A general consensus was reached on the fact that the informal sector in Ghana was very different from that of India and Pakistan. In Ghana all industries had to register themselves and had unions. They also discussed issues like whether after the completion of their course, ITI students are treated like casual labourers within the labour market or not. Kenneth quoted Chapter 7 of the Human Development Report in South Asia (1997) which makes a distinctive comment on contractual labour in Pakistan. It was also felt that perhaps the Indian skills survey should not narrow down on occupations because there are not a great number of mechanics or dress makers unlike in Ghana.

Tuesday: 5 June 2007

Session 1:

Brainstorming on the research design

Kenneth King first pointed out some similarities & differences as understood by him from the presentations of research designs made on the previous day. (See Chart 1, 2 and 3). This led to a useful discussion.

It was decided that we could have 4 sets of questions in the questionnaire. These were:

1. Life histories of young people, father's interview

2. Established successful owners – older people – should it also be life histories
3. VTIs, private, NGO – Vocational training institute
4. Group discussions

Chart 1: Whom to interview

Ghana	India	Pakistan
48 Self employed – mechanics/ dress makers	40-60 young men (divided by caste and occupation)- Life histories of successes	30 – 40 young people
16 more established	6 more established workplace owners	Yes
VTIs, private, NGO – Vocational training institute- 6		
2-3 key informants per site total 8 to 12 - institutions	2-3 key informants per site total 8 to 12 – community	
Group discussion or interviews with apprentices – 4	Group discussions in community or in government institutions	Yes
Wage workers, journey men in established enterprises - 16	Fathers – 40 –60	Yes
VTI graduates successful	Gender case studies if possible	
Policy makers	Policy makers	

Chart 2: Occupations mentioned

Ghana	Pakistan	India
IT communications technology – males and females	Leathers: Traditional skills even in urban areas	Tailoring (skill in transition)
Furniture	Mehndi	Driving/ Transport
Dress making	Caste linked occupations	
Automotive engineering		Labour contracting/ training
Hair dressing/ personal care	tailoring, embroidery and dress making	Traditional crafts
Automotive engineering	some high tech, telecommunications	Computer related work

Some interesting aspects of the discussion were as follows:

Differences in the Research Design:

- Gender is approached differently. Pakistan will possibly choose female home based workers.

- Ghana may go back to earlier set of occupations. In **Ghana** on-the-job training in factories. Apprentices will pay a fee to get trained. May become a wage employee once they learn.
- Wage workers – in India they are employed in small retail, manufacturing but as was pointed out mainly in services.

Meera commented that Indian apprentices get pocket money, the master craftsmen makes the apprentices work whole day, and after they learn the emoluments may increase.

Driving in Ghana – people go in a transport centre and start as an assistant, collect money and close the door, wash the car, and slowly start driving. Claire pointed out that in India poor will also go to driving schools.

One issue of interest was the interview with the fathers:-

Kenneth wanted to know if fathers will be included in the survey. He wanted to check if all fathers will be interviewed. Subroto replied that father or any other elder male member in the family could be interviewed, if father was not there. Claire suggested that we select a priority member and this could be an introductory interview. We could ask him questions on aspirations, expectations, family and gender dynamics.

Kenneth said that mothers take daughters for apprenticeship and fathers take sons in Ghana. So mother should be respondent in a girl's interview and father should be respondent in a boy's interview.

David said data on individuals will be collected. We also want an overall picture. For individuals he will prefer group discussion.

Claire felt that for the father's interview it is not an information collecting exercise but aspirations, preferences, investment kind of exercise. This gives us a better chance to meet the son. In Ghana it was pointed out that though parents pay for and negotiate apprenticeship they do not play as prominent a role in decision making as do their counterparts in India and Pakistan.

Adeel wanted to understand if owners will be studied differently in Ghana and India. While Ghana looks at success and reasons behind it, India focuses more on problems and apprenticeships. Claire said that we will look at both but will focus on employees not employers.

Chart 3: Different types of training

Ghana	Pakistan	India
Formal training	Home based training	Formal training
An indepth analysis of traditional apprenticeship system (internal dynamics)		Ustad – shagird training
Non-apprenticeship based training – IT		Home based training

Learning on the job – formal sector		Contract labour – learning by doing
-------------------------------------	--	-------------------------------------

Occupations:

Pakistan has tailoring, embroidery and dress making, some high tech, telecommunications but a lot of traditional skills. Kenneth said it will be interesting to capture these. In a non micro based enterprise. some of them are wage workers and had gone outside. In many places casual labourers are used particularly in top firms. Are we going to look at that? There were several training systems in the three states. On the job training in formal sector could consist of apprenticeship and formal training. Claire was worried areas of training in formal institutions are quite technical and we will not have the expertise. Claire asked why exclusively low skilled occupations were associated with the informal sector. There should be equal stress on the continuum of education and skill training. Subrata extended this to a deliberate focus on low skills. He said we should be aware of the whole picture. Why was there no mention of formal versus informal, government versus private. Kenneth said it is still on the agenda. He felt the contractor's study in India may reveal the formal sector linkage. He also felt that it was worth exploring the exploitative work in the formal sector where the informal sector is embedded (employed).

On type of schedules:

Claire felt there were three compartments - households, workplace and institutions. Ghana was not going to households but looking at the same age group, and so it is quite similar. Could we not develop these schedules in a joint way? However David felt we are not necessarily looking at successful people but ones who have been working for a longer time. Some may be truly successful, and some just getting by.

Kenneth felt we need two schedules – for youth and for training institution. Enabling environment is very important and needs to be assessed carefully.

The Gender Dimension:

Feyza said they were planning similarly but do not have numbers and don't know the community. The Pakistani team would want to cover gender but were not sure whether they will find working women. She had found only one in her survey. Owners were male. Meera said this may be possible in home based work. Feyza agreed. But felt they may not have any home based workers in their sample. It was suggested that they look for such a site if possible.

Claire asked David if both males and females could be found in dress making to address the gender concerns. But David said that this is the primary aspiration for women and he will study it in this backdrop.

Adeel felt each category has a number of dimensions. We need to have specific questions on each site.

On Research Assistants

Claire cautioned that the danger lies in the type of Research Analysts (RAs) – if they were linguistically strong and do the work correctly one sort of data will be collected. For the less qualified RAs we will get a more quantitative data. So we must agree on the type of RAs. David added that education standard is very poor in Ghana and RAs will be of a very different quality. He could not entrust them to do the qualitative research on their own. Every evening he has to go over it. We should accept the reality and structure schedules that way. Kenneth felt that Lesley has realised that a sense of belonging to a project is required for the RAs.

The cost of upper levels of schools education

David – for computers we need senior secondary. Ghana has nine years of basic education $6+3 = 9$. No exam before that. This is meant to be free – some levies but no fees. Govt. pays even that for the poor. Senior secondary is next three years – 3-4 times fees of VTIs. In India the fees are not so high, but numbers have gone up and so parents need to give many inputs for the books and tuition. In India if children reach class 9 they want to reach class 10th. In Ghana that used to be the situation but now it has changed. Pakistan is similar to Ghana in this respect. At class 10 they have the board exams. School fees are not very high but one has to take tuitions.

Caste and Occupation

Kenneth – clusters of workers tend to be from the same caste.

Caste has a strong link with occupation in India, especially among the lower castes and to some extent also in Pakistan. In Pakistan it may not always be that same caste is in the same occupation in all areas, but in a particular area it will be so. Like mochis, barbers etc.

In India statue making is not necessarily in the same caste group status – only a particular caste can make a particular god's image offered Subrata.

Claire said that we want to consider the nuances of aspirations, caste and occupation. Options are determined not only by access to information but also by what the informant perceives to be a choice – caste groups are important in this respect. According to David – social composition is interesting. There are many very young workers in Ghana.

Session 2: – The enabling environment.
Kenneth King

Chart 4: Assessing Enabling/Disabling Environment

1. Legislative environment	Impact of legislation on registration, employment security, firm size, children's work (Interviews with ILO, UNICEF, Local legal counsel, NGOs)
2. Certification frame work	Formalisation of informal sector, out of poverty (interviews of national commissions, councils, informal sector associations)
3. Informal sector association	Concern will be on quality of training (exploitation), representative role of associates as intermediaries
4. Credit Agencies and Business advice	Key concerns with access to funds for start up, advice (banks, mobile banking, indigeneous credit)
5. Social, cultural frame work	What are the tradition, values, norms, social sanctions, caste etc impact on access, quality and outcomes. (Interviews with community leaders, university experts on sociology, history etc)
6. Opportunities for self employment	Market saturation/ or demand growing (interviews with key informants)
7. Learning opportunities and Skills training environment	Major policy issues impacting on skills development at national and state level. (interviews with policy community – local and national)
8. Infrastructural development environment Political economic background	Key factors – roads, markets, electricity, water, sewage, access to secure sites (national and state level economic development plan, plans for growth

Kenneth felt that these could be kept in mind when deciding on the sites

He then talked about plurality of occupation. Subrata's suggestion was to put together a theoretical framework.

Rob Palmer's findings from household survey

The work had been done in Ghana by a team of people who had worked with Francis Teale. Kenneth King presented findings from the quantitative survey. The frequencies had been sent by Rob Palmer. However these were very preliminary. The project was presented to DFID as a combination of quantitative and qualitative work.

There are some questions in the household survey about who received on-the-job training, apprenticeship, technical/vocational school. What type of skills did you acquire/ Cost of doing that, how was it funded, full time/part time, weeks of training. Who are the providers? Rob had done an analysis: 65% of those with training had no certification, 25% had trade certification and 5% had VTI. 70% of the entire sample was doing apprenticeship, and 1% was in vocational training. The question was: How to interpret

these numbers – for apprenticeship is also on the job training. There were questions regarding sampling methods and findings in it.

It was felt that while this gives an important reference point for Ghana, for India and Pakistan this is not sufficient.

Session 3: Group Discussions

At this point the house was split into two groups for discussion of the schedules.

Group 1: Kenneth, Adeel, Claire, Meera, Subroto, Srimanti, -
Agreed to disagree

The schedules of the 3 countries did not match.
They were common only upto current livelihood activity.

Training of apprentices will be useful in getting the pathways.
A good question is: After start up why some are more successful and some not.

Out of poverty questions were good and could be adapted. Use a similar framework for benefits of education. Between the two – we get outcomes of education and emergence from poverty.

Kenneth commented that for livelihood history we should have careful periodisation of stages. Quite complex pathways.

Other insights included

1. Disabling environment – corruption needs to be captured.
2. Trade specific schedules were needed for different trades.
3. Different parts had to be made for masters and owners or employees.
4. CORD's skill schedules were felt to be too open-ended – will be given many prompts.
5. Schedules for owners/employers - reaction was positive

Group 2: Anuradha, Feyza, David, Aanchal, Rashi, Neeru

This group felt the background should be retained.
For qualitative survey India and Pakistan could use the Ghana questionnaire but we could adapt it to suit our requirements. Anuradha felt that questions on background could be asked later because it is difficult to get details initially.

The format of the questionnaire should be:

1. Questions on skills
2. Current activity

3. Previous activity
4. Perceptions about role of education and training
5. Out of poverty
6. Conclusion – well being

Enterprise environment questions should be asked at institutional level from key informant. David felt we should also have a group discussion with apprentices who would have some common interests.

Summing up Claire felt a number of differences between Ghana and Pakistan and India had emerged. Poverty had to be understood in the local context. An understanding of environment – transport, telephones, market network – forward and backward linkages, costs of infrastructure – is needed. The workshop had been a fruitful experience but we needed to keep in touch by mail as we each developed the research design & kept the comparability element in mind.